

Thayer's Gull
8 Nov 1981
Coralville Res., Johnson Co., IA
*Francis Moore
IBL 52:43

Record Number: 81-15
Classification: NA

DOCUMENTATION

Francis L. Moore

REFERENCE

Records Committee: IBL 52:43

LETTERS

Terence R. Wahl to Michael C. Newlon, 31 July 1982, with
comments from Dennis R. Paulson

Paul Lehman with note by Jon Dunn, 7 September 1982

VOTE: 2 III, 2 IV, 3 V

V, Not sure.

IV, Suggest defer action on these until we know what we are
talking about.

V, Same as 81-14 (2 of the three).

V, If these were the same birds as in 81-14, I am now unsure.
Moore states "not much contrast between body color and primaries
or tail band". The question is: how much? From Kent's Nov 7
photos, I agree with Peterjohn and conclude "too much". Pale tail
band can show in Herring also.

81-15

31 July 1982

Dr. Michael C. Newlon
408 Wales St.
Iowa City IA 52240

Dear Mike,

At long last, here are the gull record photos and descriptions. On first looking over some photos I was almost convinced some were Thayer's, only to be "unconvinced" when I looked at another photo of the same bird from another angle (dorsal, ventral, etc.). I have been extremely busy this summer and the whole pile got buried then for some time. When I found it again (with some horror and shame) I hurriedly passed it on to Dennis Paulson, whom I respect as the best in the Northwest at this kind of thing.

As you can see from his comments, Dennis went at it and started his comments without all his references handy, so the summary of this review/judgment is in the postscript(!). I have gone over the records again after Dennis returned them to me and concur with his judgment. I can take no "credit" for the review, however: Dennis did the work.

Yours truly,



Terence R. Wahl

COMMENTS ABOUT IOWA THAYER'S GULL RECORDS

(also, underwing coverts may be too dark for Thayer's)

#1 - this description for the most part seems fine for a first-winter Thayer's, but at the same time it is not too discrepant for a first-winter Herring, that very variable species. The bill and head configuration certainly are fine for Thayer's, but it may be that some smallest Herrings could overlap this. I don't know what to make of the white trailing edge of the tail as a field mark; skins in the Burke Museum don't show this any better developed for Thayer's than for Herring, in fact it is not prominent usually. I don't think a paler feather edge would develop from feather wear, as the description implied for a Herring Gull, if anything just the reverse--pale edges wear off with time. The flight shots, which I am not sure represent either one or two individuals, to me show too much dark color under the outer primaries for Thayer's. Most (all?) Thayer's show uniformly gray under the primaries, not any darker on the outer ones than the inner ones, and the shot of the bottom bird on the page with 3 pictures shows clearly darker outer primaries, as does the bird on the other page (bearing in mind that backlighted feathers may look different). We have two Thayer's wings available in the collection here, and both of them are uniformly pale, the outer primaries exactly like the inners. I don't really know the extent of the variation possible, but I do know that underwings of Herring and even Western can look fairly pale with backlighting. Unfortunately I have no comparable photographs of first-year Herrings in flight, and it's too bad that the observers didn't try to get such pictures for their own comparison. Thus this bird (these birds) could well be Thayer's, but the descriptions and photos don't totally confirm the identification, in my opinion.

#2 - this bird again looks superficially like a good Thayer's, the head/bill shape and size identical to birds I have photographed. Note that Thayer's can have a head just as flat as that of any other gull at times--this difference is overemphasized in the literature and doubtless will go on confusing people. I am disturbed that I cannot get any sign of the paler underwing tips of Thayer's from the photos, nor does the description mention them, although it does mention paler proximal primaries (see above comments). Again, identification rests on bill size, which of course overlaps considerably in Herring/Thayer's. This bird has even less credibility than the preceding one as a Thayer's.

#3 - with no photographic documentation it becomes even more difficult to assess records such as this. The lack of "actual" Herring Gulls to compare with these birds is of course critical, and I would have liked to have seen definite differences described in underwing color/shade between the two seen under similar conditions in flight. The fact that they were 175-250 yards away certainly precludes good study. I don't see that anything discussed here clearly points to these birds being Thayer's.

#4 - again, the description matches Thayer's well enough, but I don't think it is outside the known variation of Herring, which certainly can have an entirely black bill in winter (I assume all or most of such birds I have seen in Massachusetts in November were Herrings...) as well as a variety of types of scapular edging. Again, observation in flight would have been most definitive, although not if in isolation away from known Herring Gulls. I really think that lighting on wings can be tricky, and with lots of Herring and even more Thayer's to look at here in Washington, I am confused by some individual birds. Again, probably a Thayer's but not for sure.

#5 - this is an excellent description and seems as much like a first-year Thayer's as any of those I read. I wish it had been photographically documented. Note that it matches the description of bird #1, however, and the photos of that bird aren't quite enough to convince me of Thayer's because more dark color is present under the wing than is usual. Excuse me, I just found the photographs of it. They are not at all compelling, the top one unfortunately having the underwing blurred; again, they could be a Thayer's, but they also might not.

#6 - (I suppose there is an error in the date here, listed as Dec. 1982); again, this description sounds like Thayer's Gull in wing coloration, especially the contrast between upper and under surface, although again I would have liked a detailed description of how the Herring Gulls looked under these conditions. It sounds as if the observer had abundant opportunities to compare the birds, nevertheless, and again this sighting has a good chance of being a Thayer's. Again, it is unfortunate there is no photographic record of it.

SUMMARY: On first glance at descriptions and photos, I was convinced that Thayer's Gulls were being observed in Iowa, even if all the records were not equally convincing. On detailed examination of the same material, I am left a bit more dubious, because of comments above. Nevertheless, it seems hard to believe that the observers aren't seeing smaller, smaller-billed, lighter underwinged birds with their Herring Gulls, and they may all be Thayer's. Collecting one would be a very good idea at this point, just to confirm in the hand what people are seeing in the field at different distances and under different lighting conditions. The two species do overlap in virtually all characteristics in first-year plumage, and identification rests on a constellation of characters.

POSTSCRIPT: All of the above was written with one big disadvantage--I did not have accessible my photographs of Thayer's and Herring Gulls. Subsequently I have gone through American Birds issue by issue for the last ten years to look for photos of Thayer's. Looking at all these photos has convinced me, contrary to previous comments, that probably none of the above records are Thayer's! I advise the observers to look at the following photographs in that journal:

AB 26: 445--this "Iceland Gull" was subsequently reidentified as a Thayer's (which I had thought it was on seeing the photo), and it shows what I mean about the underwing.

AB 31: 318--this bird shows the rather uniform dorsal aspect of the wings, much less contrasty than the photos of Iowa #1, and also the pale underwing tip, without the dark tip/pale window effect described for the Iowa birds.

AB 34: 266--these two birds show the rather pale wingtips (left bird is undoubtedly the spring one, rather worn) and the lack of very contrasty sections of the wings.

AB 29: 51--again, the overall pale appearance is apparent. As has been stressed by some authors, this species is at least as similar to Kumlien's as to Herring, perhaps more so in some ways. Note also that none of the birds in these photos is particularly pale-headed, a feature I found a bit odd on one or more of the Iowa photos--and of course in the West we often use the pale-headed effect on some young Herrings to distinguish them from Westerns.

I hope these comments are taken as constructive ones and especially that recourse to the AB photos cited here will be of great value to Iowa observers. There is little doubt that Thayer's Gull should/does occur in Iowa, but I don't believe its presence has been documented there yet.

Dennis Paulson

Dennis R. Paulson
Burke Museum
University of Washington
Seattle, WA 98195

81-15

P.O. Box 1061
Goleta, Calif.
93116

7 Sept. 1982

Comments on Several Iowa Records of Thayer's Gull

Before giving my thoughts on each of the individual Thayer's Gull records, I would like to make a few comments on my article which appeared in Birding 12(6). The artist's plate (p. 200) was never seen by me before the article was published. While it is "O.K.", I'm not crazy about the bill shape shown and the primaries on the first-year bird are too dark; this may have partly resulted in the mis-identifications I believe were made in the Iowa birds. Several of the black and white photos in the Birding article were also reproduced too darkly. The cover photo of that issue (in color) shows the primary color much more accurately.

I believe each of the records of Iowa Thayer's Gulls sent to me is either definitely or probably of Herring Gulls. None are definitely Thayer's. Certainly all the photos that accompany several of them are of Herrings. A real problem I see with each is that the written details for each sound possible for Thayer's, but that the photos of the same individuals show them clearly to be Herrings and, in part, conflict with the written details. Those without photos are more difficult to evaluate. In every case, female Herrings may well have been involved; this sex averages smaller and rounder headed than the male, giving it more of a "Thayer's" look.

Record #1 (2 at Lake Manawa, 19 March 1981):

The photos show a bird that, at rest, appears too dark overall for a Thayer's in March (too gray and smudgey, not paler brown and more flecked); the pale-headed look to the bird is better for Herring; and the primaries definitely appear too dark and lack pale edges to the tips of the primaries (in other words, the primaries seem fine for Herring). In flight, both the uppersurface and under-surface of the primaries are much too dark. See the flight photo of a Thayer's from underneath on page 205 of the Birding article; the outer primaries are as pale as the inner primaries and secondaries. The Lake Manawa birds look very much like Herring Gulls.

Record #2 (2 at Coralville Res., 7 November 1981):

The photos show one major problem with the birds being thayer's: the primaries are too dark and lack the pale edges to the primary tips (a bird in November is in fresh plumage and shows these pale tips). They appear to be Herrings. The small head and smaller billed look can be attributed to the birds probably being females.

Record #3 (3 at Coralville Res., 8 November 1981):

Why aren't two of these the same as in "Record #2"? (which I believe to be Herrings). Not enough specifics in written details; description could fit either Herring or Thayer's.

Record #4 (1 at Lake Manawa, 5 December 1981):

"Chocolate" brown primaries sound too dark for Thayer's. Other marks mentioned could fit a Thayer's, also a female Herring. Not seeing coloration of the primaries (above and below) in flight an important omission.

Record #5 (1 at Coralville Res., 6 December 1981):

Photo of bird in flight (taking off) shows underwings to be much too dark for Thayer's. Overall coloration of bird also appears to be too dark. Appears to be a Herring Gull.

Record #6 (1 at Saylorville Dam, 10-17 Dec. "1982" (sic)):

Plumage "grayish-brown" fits Herring better; Thayer's more of a tan-brown. Pink at base of bill not typical for a Thayer's in December (but fine for Herring). Again, not really enough in description to be certain; were absolutely all the primaries from underneath a "ghost-gray"? (should really have been whitish). I believe there isn't enough in this description to be positive of an identification.

Hope these comments have been of some help.

Sorry to be only "negative" on all of the records, but they were either clearly of Herring Gulls or lacked sufficient details and could either have involved Herring or Thayer's. I am sure that Thayer's occurs in Iowa somewhat regularly, however.

Sincerely,

Paul Lehman

Paul Lehman

P.S. If you have any further questions, feel free to ask.

P.S.S. I'm sorry that I don't now have the time to respond in detail, but all of the photos I examined here are unequivocally Herring Gulls. I can give a detailed response in November if you want to send them back. JD

(Iron Dunn)

Summary of Review of an Ornithologic Observation

by the Records Committee

81-15

of the Iowa Ornithologists' Union

SPECIES: *Thayer's Gull*

DATE SEEN: 8 Nov 1981

SITE OF OBSERVATION: *Conduite Res*

OBSERVERS: *Francis Moore*

DATE OF REVIEW: 1982, 8 May 1982

METHOD OF REVIEW: *mail, meeting*

CLASSIFICATION OF RECORD: V

COMMENTS:

None of the 5 fall 1982 reports of *Thayer's Gull* was accepted.

The Committee hopes to have these records reviewed by outside consultants.

The Committee is unsure, even with photos, whether these birds are *Thayer's* or *Herring Gulls*.

P.S. *Hawk Owl, Kittiwake, Western Tanager* accepted (form sent to Myers).

Any action may be re-reviewed upon submission of additional evidence.

Explanation of Classification:

- I = labeled, diagnostic specimen, photograph, or recording available for review by the Committee
- II = acceptable sight record documented independently by 3 or more observers
- III = acceptable sight record documented by 1 or 2 observers
- IV = probably correct record, but not beyond doubt
- V = record with insufficient evidence to judge
- VI = probably incorrect identification, escapee, or otherwise unacceptable record

Classification is based on the highest category agreed upon by six of seven committee members.

What species? Thayer's Gull (*Larus thayeri*) How many? 3

Location? Coralville Reservoir

Type of habitat? Open water near small sandy beach near the Dam area, Johnson County

When? date(s): November 8, 1981 time: 8:10 to 9:30

Who? your name and address: Francis L. Moore, 264 Western Ave., Waterloo, IA 50701

others with you: Russell Hays, Tom Kent, Tom Shires, Tom Stout, many others

others before or after you: Don't know, probably many more.

Describe the bird(s) including only what you observed. Include size, shape, details of all parts (bill, eye, head, neck, back, wing, tail, throat, breast, belly, under tail, legs, feet). Also mention voice and behavior. The three birds seen were about the size of Herring Gulls in typical first year plumage. They were obviously large gulls of the genus *Larus* with a noticeably larger size than the Ring-billed Gulls and one Bonaparte's Gull that were next to the three larger birds. The birds had an overall brown look to them. There were no Herring Gulls nearby with which to make a comparison of size and coloration. The bills of all three gulls were black did not seem as heavy or bulky as the bill of a Herring Gull. There was not much of a contrast between the overall body color and the color of the primaries and the tail band. This gave the appearance of being an even colored bird over the top portion of the body. One of the birds that I got a better look at showed the whitish trailing edge on the tail. The tail band of all three birds was of a very uniform size from one side to the other and was fairly broad. Eventually, after most of the other observers had left, the gulls began to fly short distances and come closer to the shore. At this time the characteristic described by Paul Lehman in *Birding* was noticeable. As the birds were in flight and banked against the light the primaries and other flight feathers were of a translucent cast. All of the above characteristics in combination indicate that the birds are Thayer's Gulls. Most views of the three birds were from about 175 to 250 yards away. Feather edging on the primaries and most feathers of the back was evident and gave the bird a marbled look to its back.

Similar species and how eliminated: Ring-billed Gull and Herring Gull, see above.

The Ring-billed Gulls were seen in direct contrast to these three birds and were definitely much smaller birds. The Herring Gulls (first year birds) that I have seen have more of a contrast between the rump and back and upper wing surfaces and none that I remember showed the whitish trailing edge on the tail.

Did any one disagree or have reservations about identification? A few

If yes, explain: There was not an immature Herring gull upon which to compare these three birds.

Viewing conditions: give lighting, distance (how measured), and optical equipment:

Lighting was bright overcast to sunny; birds seen at approx. 30 yards on beach to 1/4 mile on the water; viewed through 7X 35mm B+L Roof Prism Binoculars, 20X and 40X eyepieces on Bushnell Spacemaster telescope, and through 750mm Celestron telescope.

Previous experience with species and similar ones: No previous experience with this species, but have seen many Ring-billed and Herring Gulls.

References and persons consulted before writing description: General Notes of Iowa Bird Life June 1981, Volume 51, No. 2; Identification of Thayer's Gull in the Field, *Birding*, December 1980 Volume XII, No. 6.

How long before field notes made? 5 hours this form completed? 2 days

MAIL TO: T. H. Kent, Field Reports Editor, 211 Richards Street, Iowa City IA 52240